

August 24, 1999

Ms. Kimberley Mickelson Olson & Olson Three Allen Center, Suite 3485 333 Clay Street Houston, Texas 7702

OR99-2429

Dear Ms. Mickelson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 127704.

The City of Alvin received a request for records pertaining to a city police officer. You seek to withhold a portion of the information responsive to the request under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.111 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 protects "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision," including information coming within the common-law right to privacy. *Industrial Found. of the South v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). Common-law privacy protects information if it is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, *and* it is of no legitimate concern to the public. *Id.* at 683-85. Most of the information which you claim is protected by common law privacy relates to the job performance of public employees and therefore is of legitimate public interest. Such material is not protected by common-law privacy. We have marked one document under your Tab A which must be withheld under common-law privacy principles. *See* Open Records Decision No. 545 (1990) (personal financial information not relating to transaction with government is protected by common-law privacy).

Section 552.108 excepts from required public disclosure

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if:

- (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;
- (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication; or

(3) it is information that:

- (A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or
- (B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state [and]
- (b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if:
 - (1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution;
 - (2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication; or

(3) the internal record or notation:

- (A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or
- (B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

In our opinion, you have not established that release of the information for which you claim the protection of section 552.108 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime, or otherwise fall under the protection of section 552.108. None of the submitted information may be withheld under that section.

Section 552.111 excepts interagency and intra-agency memoranda and letters, but only to the extent that they contain advice, opinion, or recommendation intended for use in the entity's policymaking process. Open Records Decision No. 615 (1993). The purpose of this section is "to protect from public disclosure advice and opinions on policy matters and to encourage frank and open discussion within the agency in connection with its decision-making processes." Austin v. City of San Antonio, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.--San Antonio 1982, writ ref'd n.r.e.) (emphasis added). In Open Records Decision No. 615, this office held that

to come within the [section 552.111] exception, information must be related to the *policymaking* functions of the governmental body. An agency's policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative and personnel matters [Emphasis in original.]

In our opinion, the information for which you claim the protection of section 552.111 relates to personnel matters rather than the city's policy-making functions. Consequently, none of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.111.

We note, however, that included among the submitted information are accident report forms that appear to have been completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. See Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). The Seventy-fifth Legislature, repealed V.T.C.S. article 6701d, and amended section 550.065 of the Transportation Code concerning the disclosure of accident report information. Act of May 29, 1997, 75th Leg., R.S. ch. 1187. 1997 Tex. Gen. Laws 4575, 4582-4583 (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065). However, a Travis County district court has issued a temporary injunction enjoining the enforcement of the amendment to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. Texas Daily Newspaper Ass'n, v. Morales, No. 97-08930 (345th Dist. Ct., Travis County, Tex., Oct. 24, 1997) (second amended agreed temporary injunction). A temporary injunction preserves the status quo until the final hearing of a case on its merits. Janus Films, Inc. v. City of Fort Worth, 358 S.W.2d 589 (1962). The Supreme Court has defined the status quo as "the last, actual peaceable, non-contested status that preceded the pending controversy." Texas v. Southwestern Bell Tel. Co. 526 S.W.2d 526, 528 (Tex. 1975). The status quo of accident report information prior to the enactment of S.B. 1069 is governed by section 47 of article 6701d, V.T.C.S.¹

¹Although the Seventy-fourth Legislature repealed and codified article 6701d as part of the Transportation Code, the legislature did not intend a substantive change of the law but merely a recodification of existing law. Act of May 1, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 165, §§ 24, 25 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 1025, 1870-71. Furthermore, the Seventy-fourth Legislature, without reference to the repeal and codification of V.T.C.S. article 6701d, amended section 47 of article 6701d, V.T.C.S., relating to the disclosure of accident reports. Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 894, § 1, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 4413, 4414. Because the repeal of a statute by a code does not affect an amendment of the statute by the same legislature which enacted the code, the amendment is preserved and given effect as part of the code provision. Gov't Code § 311.031(c). Thus,

Section 47(b)(1) provides that:

The Department or a law enforcement agency employing a peace officer who made an accident report is required to release a copy of the report on request to:

. . . .

- (D) a person who provides the Department or the law enforcement agency with two or more of the following:
 - (i) the date of the accident;
 - (ii) the name of any person involved in the accident; or
 - (iii) the specific location of the accident

V.T.C.S. art. 6701d, § 47(b)(1) (emphasis added). Under this provision, a law enforcement agency "is required to release" a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the law enforcement agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In the situation at hand, the requestor has not provided the city with the requisite information. Therefore, the accident reports (in your Tab D) must be withheld.

We note that the submitted information includes licence plate number information which must be withheld under section 552.130. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

- (a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if the information relates to:
 - (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
 - (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

We have marked the kind of license plate number information which must be withheld under section 552.130.

the amendment of section 47 of article 6701d, V.T.C.S. is the existing law regarding the availability of accident report information, and may be found following section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. See also Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 894, § 1, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 4413, 4414.

Finally, we note that you seek to withhold certain information under section 552.117. Sections 552.117 requires withholding a peace officer's home address, home telephone number, social security number, or information that reveals that the individual has family members. You argue that information relating to an individual who was involved in an accident with an officer at the officer's residence should be withheld so that the requestor can not contact that party and obtain the officer's home address. We find no basis for withholding such information under section 552.117. We note however, that the submitted information does contain some information subject to section 552.117. We have marked the kind of information you must withhold under section 552.117. Except as noted above, you must release the submitted information.

We are resolving this matter with an informal letter ruling rather than with a published open records decision. This ruling is limited to the particular records at issue under the facts presented to us in this request and should not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records. If you have questions about this ruling, please contact our office.

Sincerely,

William Walker

Assistant Attorney General

Alchan han

Open Records Division

WMW/ch

Ref:

ID# 127704

Encl.

Submitted documents

cc:

Mr. Ricky Forrest 1718 W. Dumble, #4 Alvin, Texas 77511 (w/o enclosures)